



County Hall  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW  
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir  
Caerdydd  
CF10 4UW  
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

## AGENDA

<b>Committee</b>	ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
<b>Date and Time of Meeting</b>	TUESDAY, 6 OCTOBER 2020, 4.30 PM
<b>Venue</b>	REMOTE VIA MS TEAMS
<b>Membership</b>	Councillor Patel (Chair) Councillors Derbyshire, Owen Jones, Lancaster, Jackie Parry, Parkhill, Owen, Sandrey and Wong

		<i>Time approx.</i>
<b>1</b>	<b>Apologies for Absence</b>  To receive apologies for absence.	4.30 pm
<b>2</b>	<b>Declarations of Interest</b>  To be made at the start of the agenda item in question, in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.	
<b>3</b>	<b>Minutes</b> ( <i>Pages 5 - 8</i> )  To approve as a correct record the minutes on 15 September 2020.	
<b>4</b>	<b>Shared Regulatory Services - Covid Update</b> ( <i>Pages 9 - 16</i> )  To provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the current position of Shared Regulatory Services, and the impact that the current Covid crisis has had upon service delivery.	4.40 pm
<b>5</b>	<b>Waste Management - Covid Update</b> ( <i>Pages 17 - 20</i> )  To provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the current position of the Waste Management Service, and the impact that the current Covid crisis has had upon service delivery and capital projects.	5.15 pm

- 6 Environmental Scrutiny Committee - Work Programme Planning 2020/21** (Pages 21 - 32) 5.50 pm
- An item to provide the Committee with an opportunity to discuss and identify items for the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Work Programme 2020/21.
- 7 One Planet Cardiff - Member Briefing Note** (Pages 33 - 44) 6.30 pm
- An item for the Committee to discuss the content of the report due to be presented to Cabinet titled 'One Planet Cardiff – A Response to the Climate Emergency', and to discuss arrangements for a short scrutiny exercise to feed into the wider consultation exercise for the One Planet Cardiff strategy.
- 8 Housing Retrofit - Local Authority Flexible Eligibility for Eco** (Pages 45 - 52) 6.45 pm
- An item for the Committee to discuss the content of the report due to be presented to Cabinet titled 'Housing Retrofit – Local Authority Flexible Eligibility for Eco'. This report aims to approve and publish a "Statement of Intent" for the Council to use the Government's "Local Authority Flexible Eligibility for ECO", so that fuel poor households from the Rent Smart Wales Warm Homes Fund project, and potential future projects of a similar nature, can benefit from additional private sector funding to improve their homes.
- 9 Environmental Scrutiny Committee - Draft Annual Report 2018/19** (Pages 53 - 100) 6.55 pm
- Principal Scrutiny Officer to talk Members through the Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Draft Annual Report. Members will be asked to consider the report, decide if any alterations are required and agree a final format to be presented to Council.
- 10 Urgent Items (if any)**
- 11 Way Forward**
- To review the evidence and information gathered during consideration of each agenda item, agree Members comments, observations and concerns to be passed on to the relevant Cabinet Member by the Chair, and to note items for inclusion on the Committee's Forward Work Programme.
- 12 Date of next meeting - 3 November 2020 at 4.30pm**

**Davina Fiore**

**Director Governance & Legal Services**

Date: Wednesday, 30 September 2020

Contact: Graham Porter, 02920 873401, g.porter@cardiff.gov.uk

## **WEBCASTING**

**This meeting will be filmed for live and/or subsequent broadcast on the Council's website. The whole of the meeting will be filmed, except where there are confidential or exempt items, and the footage will be on the website for 6 months. A copy of it will also be retained in accordance with the Council's data retention policy.**

**Members of the public may also film or record this meeting.**

**If you make a representation to the meeting you will be deemed to have consented to being filmed. By entering the body of the Chamber you are also consenting to being filmed and to the possible use of those images and sound recordings for webcasting and/or training purposes. If you do not wish to have your image captured you should sit in the public gallery area.**

**If you have any queries regarding webcasting of meetings, please contact Committee Services on 02920 872020 or email [Democratic Services](#)**

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

15 SEPTEMBER 2020

Present: Councillor Patel(Chairperson)  
Councillors Derbyshire, Owen Jones, Lancaster, Jackie Parry,  
Parkhill, Owen, Sandrey and Wong

1 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

No apologies for absence were received.

2 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

3 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 3 March 2020 were approved by the Committee as a correct record.

4 : PLANNING, TRANSPORT & ENVIRONMENT DIRECTORATE - COVID  
UPDATE - SERVICE AREAS & CAPITAL PROGRAMME

The Committee received a report providing Members with an opportunity to consider the current position of the Planning, Transport and Environment Directorate and the impacts that the Covid-19 pandemic has had upon service delivery and capital projects.

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Michael Michael, Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling and Environment, Councillor Caro Wild, Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning and Transport, Andrew Gregory, Director of Planning Transport and Environment and a number of officers from the senior management team in the directorate.

After brief statements from the Cabinet Member the Director was invited to deliver a presentation and comment on the impact of the crisis. The presentation focussed on the following areas:

- Budget
- Performance Objectives
- Main Challenges
- Capital Programme
- Future opportunities

The Chairperson invited the Committee to comment, raise questions or seek clarification on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members asked for further details of the impact the pandemic was having on the dogs home. Members were advised that the dogs home responded to the

pandemic by putting its business continuity plan in place. This included placing 25 dogs with foster homes for the duration of the pandemic – 20 of which have stayed with the foster homes. The service is operational now. New volunteers have been induced and dog walkers are now received via an appointment system.

- Officers were asked to comment on the authority's response to the recent proliferation of 'e-scooters' in the City. Officers advised that request have been received for Cardiff to become a pilot area for 'e-scooters'. Pilots are taking place in other city and guidance is expected as a result of those in terms of how e-scooters are managed.
- Members whether the pandemic has changed the authority's approach in terms of planning, transportation and air quality in the City. The authority is engaging with major employers in the City in terms of their return to work requirements and commuting. There are significant implications for the City Centre. The City Centre is a key asset and we need to ensure that we support business, retail and key infrastructure in the City Centre.
- A Member asked officers to identify which plans or service delivery areas have the highest cause for concern. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling and Environment stated that each project mentioned in the presentation has been thoroughly assessed and is deliverable. Officers indicated that the main areas of concerns are those projects aligned with the City Centre. Information on the development of a programme of works for highways improvements would be shared.
- Members asked whether the authority would promote flexible working practices as one of the largest employers in the City. Officers stated that the authority's approach to flexible working for its staff would be a matter another service area.
- Members asked whether the authority and Welsh Government have accepted that the Metro project, as designed, may not affect the workflow movements of the future. The Director stated that it was not accepted that the City will fundamentally change in terms of the importance of the City Centre and the Bay. The Metro will provide the long-term rapid-transit system that will support underpin movements in the City and it is being reinforced by Welsh Government in terms of discussions around the M4 and the alternative arrangements that may be required as a result of the M4 Commission.
- Members asked officers to explain the budget variance of zero in the presentation. The Director stated that the service area is predicted to achieve a balanced budget. Some support from Welsh Government has been received from the parking reserve. The service area is seeking to mitigate any gap in funding.
- Officers were asked to state what the advantages and disadvantages of the pandemic have been. The main change has been learning how to use technology to work from home and broadly remote working has been shown to work. It was accepted that some office working is necessary. Senior officers listed a number of advantages and disadvantages in their service areas.
- Members asked for an update regarding the completion of schemes of works to carriageway. Officers indicated that in terms of volume in square metres the schemes delivered were as expected.
- Officers were asked to provide an indication of the proportion of spending allocated to covid schemes that came from the budget and overall cost of the schemes. The Director stated that the capital cost of the schemes was met by Welsh Government.

- A members asked for comments on the consultation given to the Castle Street closure scheme, particularly in terms of access to Cardiff Central railway station. The Director stated all key facilities were still accessible including Cardiff Central railway station. There is ongoing consultation with service providers, including Cardiff Bus and other bus companies to ensure that services were continuing.
- It was noted that Bereavement Services were working at 99% capacity. Members asked whether officers were confident that the service could respond to an anticipated increased rates of death during the winter months. Officers stated that service times were reduced and services were held on Saturdays at the peak of the pandemic. Service times could be reduced further or later into the evenings or on Sundays if required.
- Members asked whether Castle Street would reopen. The Director stated that the closure is temporary for 18 months. A report on the outcome of the closure would be taken to Cabinet in the future with an update in terms of the outcomes of the closure and its impact on businesses, the view to options for a permanent proposals which would need substantial consultation.
- A Member asked whether the Castle Street scheme has displaced traffic into neighbouring wards. The Director stated that there is no evidence to suggest that any significant displacement has occurred. The position would continue to be monitored. The Chairperson asked whether there was any data of traffic movements in the inner city wards prior to and during the pandemic in terms of displacement. Officers stated that traffic signal data has been used. There is no data to suggest significant displacement has occurred.
- Members noted public transport use has fallen. Members asked what the authority was doing to encourage a return to public transport. Officers stated that the key point was to ensure bus company survival. The authority is working with Welsh Government to protect bus companies from a fall in passenger numbers. Passenger numbers are now increasing. The authority is also providing support with school transport.
- Members noted that the increase in footfall in Castle Street coincided with the launch of the Eat Out to Help Out scheme.
- Members asked for additional detail on how the school bike fleets would work in practice, particularly in terms of the lack of secure bike parking. Members were advised that 30 schools are participating in the scheme with approximately 30 wishing to join the scheme. The fleet will be held in containers on school sites. Secure cycle parking will be provided in new build schools.

RESOLVED – That the Chairperson write on behalf of the Committee to the Cabinet Member conveying their observations.

5 : ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE - DRAFT ANNUAL REPORT 2018/19

RESOLVED – That the Principal Scrutiny Officer with support from Members of the Committee draft an additional section in the report highlighting the impact of scrutiny during 2018/19. The revised would be considered at October meeting of the Committee for approval prior to the Annual Report 2019/20 be approved for submission to Council.

6 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

No urgent items were received.

7 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The date of the next meeting is to be confirmed.

The meeting terminated at 6.00 pm



**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**06 OCTOBER 2020**

---

**SHARED REGULATORY SERVICES – COVID UPDATE**

---

**Reason for the Report**

1. To provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the current position of Shared Regulatory Services, and the impact that the current Covid crisis has had upon service delivery.

**Background**

2. On the 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2020 the United Kingdom was placed into an unprecedented lockdown to help mitigate the rapid spread of the coronavirus pandemic. This drastic action was taken to minimise social contact, reduce the number of new cases and ultimately protect lives.
3. The Council is a business that focuses on serving local people, and so is heavily reliant upon social contact. This means that limiting the number of day-to-day interactions has had a huge impact on the work of the Council, and the support it provides to local residents. Shared Regulatory Services provides a broad range of services for local residents across the local authority areas of Bridgend, Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan.
4. Shared Regulatory Services operates under a Joint Working Agreement with the Head of Service reporting on service provision to a Joint Committee of Elected Members drawn from the three partner local authorities. The detailed delegations of policy and functions from partners to the Joint Committee and Head of Service are set out in the Joint Working Agreement, these include:
  - The functions to be carried out by the joint service.
  - The terms of reference and constitution of the Joint Committee, the Management Board, etc..

- The term of the proposed Shared Regulatory Services such as staffing, the services to be provided by the host and other partners, financing and other functional issues.
- The financial operating model.

### **Core Services Provided by Shared Regulatory Services**

5. Shared Regulatory Services provides a diverse and comprehensive range of services that safeguard the health, safety and economic wellbeing of consumers, businesses and residents. The services are covered under the three main areas of Environmental Health, Trading Standards and Licensing.
6. These broad areas encompass a wide range of services that deal with issues that can have a huge impact upon people when things go wrong or have not been enforced properly. A brief description of specific services delivered by Shared Regulatory Services is included in this section of the report.
7. **Trading Standards** – this service protects consumers and businesses by maintaining and promoting a fair and safe trading environment. This area of work ensures that businesses comply with a host of consumer protection statutes including those relating to:
  - Product safety;
  - Food standards;
  - Animal feed;
  - Age restricted sales;
  - Counterfeiting;
  - Environmental safety;
  - Weights and measures;
  - False claims about goods and services;
  - Malpractice including rogue traders, scams and doorstep crime.
8. The Trading Standards Service investigates complaints, participates in criminal investigations and exercises, conducts inspections of businesses, undertakes a sampling programme, provides consumer advice to vulnerable residents and

provides business advice to help businesses improve their trading practices. Furthermore the Trading Standards Service has the only UKAS accredited Metrology laboratory in Wales providing calibration of weights and measures of length and capacity.

9. **Food Safety** – this service protects public health by ensuring that the food we eat is without risk to the health and safety of consumers. This is achieved through regular food safety inspections of food business and guest caterers, operating the Food Hygiene Rating Scheme, providing education courses and practical advice, investigating food and hygiene related complaints, carrying out regular food and water sampling and undertaking checks on imported food.
10. **Housing Safety** – this service protects public health by working with private landlords and owners to provide warm, safe and healthy homes for tenants. They ensure that Houses in Multiple Occupation (HMO's) are licensed through Mandatory and Additional Licensing Schemes, inspecting HMO's and improving physical and management standards of privately rented accommodation. Complaints from tenants about their rented accommodation are investigated; these can include complaints about damp, mould, heating disrepair, nuisance and student housing issues. Problems with empty homes that have fallen into disrepair are addressed and immigration inspections are undertaken.
11. **Pollution** – this service protects public health by controlling noise and air emissions into the environment. The Pollution Service investigates noise complaints about issues such as amplified music, DIY activities, house and car alarms, barking dogs, and construction sites. It investigates air pollution complaints such as smoke, dust and odour and illegal burning, undertakes environmental monitoring, local air quality management and regulates emissions from industrial processes.
12. **Contaminated Land** – this service protects public health by reviewing and implementing the Contaminated Land Strategy which ensures the identification, inspection and remediation of historically contaminated sites. Private water supplies used for both domestic and commercial purposes (such as drinking, cooking, and washing) are regulated and responses are provided to Environmental Information Requests and Planning application consultations.

13. **Health and Safety** – this service protects public health and safety by working with others to ensure risks in the workplace are managed properly. This is achieved by undertaking planned inspections and targeted initiatives, investigating reported accidents, diseases, dangerous occurrences and complaints, providing advice and guidance to employers and employees and securing safety standards at outdoor events.
14. **Communicable Disease** – this service protects public health by controlling and preventing cases and outbreaks of infectious disease by investigating confirmed sporadic and outbreak cases of communicable disease, providing and reviewing advice and guidance on infection control, cleaning and disinfection, case and contact exclusions, providing training on food hygiene, nutritional and infection control, enforcing health protection legislation to minimise the spread of communicable disease and contamination from radiation and chemicals that threaten health and leading on local and national communicable disease surveillance programmes.
15. **Animal Health and Warden Services** – this service ensures the wellbeing of animals generally and during transport. It also administers animal movements to prevent the spread of diseases such as rabies, anthrax and foot & mouth. Wardens respond to complaints about straying animals such as dogs and horses.
16. **Licensing** – this service determines applications for the grant, renewal, variation and transfer of many different authorisations which are the responsibility of the three partner local authorities. Applications for licences, certificates, registrations and permits are processed and enforcement undertaken in respect of statutory requirements such as alcohol, public entertainment, gambling, street trading, taxi licences, charitable collections and animal related licensing.
17. **Pest Control** – this service offers services to the Vale of Glamorgan area for the treatment of pests and infestations. This could include, rats, wasps, mice, fleas, cockroaches etc..
18. **Port Health** - this service prevents the import of infectious and animal disease into the UK, ensuring ships comply with international agreed public health sanitation standards and improving the safety and quality of the food chain.

19. **The Wales Illegal Money Lending Unit** - this service is one of only three units operating across the UK. The Unit covers all 22 Local Authority areas in Wales with the key aim of tackling the problem of illegal money lending. The Unit is both proactive and reactive in its work providing education and promotion across Wales to various social groups and highlighting the dangers of illegal lending. The unit also carries out detailed investigations with a view to prosecuting offenders and has the capabilities to act swiftly where necessary to deal with victims of loan sharks.
20. In addition to the traditional main areas covered, Shared Regulatory Services has played a pivotal role in the delivery of the Test, Track & Trace service which has been delivered across Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan. This has placed an obvious additional resource pressure on the service.
21. This item will provide Members with an opportunity to review the impact that the Covid crisis has had upon the services (above) relevant to Shared Regulatory Services. The relevant Cabinet Members and the Head of Shared Regulatory Services have agreed to attend the meeting to support the briefing, which will include:
  - The budget position of Shared Regulatory Services as a whole, along with a summary of individual service parts;
  - How Shared Regulatory Services has performed against its performance objectives during the Covid crisis;
  - A summary of the main challenges that Shared Regulatory Services has faced during the Covid crisis;
  - A summary of the main opportunities that Shared Regulatory Services has identified during the Covid crisis;
  - A summary of key future proposals relevant to Shared Regulatory Services.

### **Way Forward**

22. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Housing & Communities have been invited to attend the meeting. In addition to this the Chair for Licensing & Public Protection has also been invited to attend. They will be supported by the Head of Shared Regulatory Services.

## **Legal Implications**

23. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to the Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

## **Financial Implications**

24. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

25. The Committee is recommended to:
- (i) Consider the information in this report and the information presented at the meeting;
  - (ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter; and,

(iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

**Davina Fiore**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**30<sup>th</sup> September 2020**

This page is intentionally left blank



**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**06 OCTOBER 2020**

---

**WASTE MANAGEMENT SERVICE – COVID UPDATE**

---

**Reason for the Report**

1. To provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the current position of the Waste Management Service, and the impact that the current Covid crisis has had upon service delivery and capital projects.

**Background**

2. On the 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2020 the United Kingdom was placed into an unprecedented lockdown to help mitigate the rapid spread of the coronavirus pandemic. This drastic action was taken to minimise social contact, reduce the number of new cases and ultimately protect lives.
3. The Council is a business that focuses on serving local people, and so is heavily reliant upon social contact. This means that limiting the number of day to day interactions has had a huge impact on the work of the Council, and the support it provides to local residents.
4. The Waste Management Service provides a range of services for local residents, these are delivered and supported by the following areas:
  - Enforcement & Cleansing;
  - Trade Waste;
  - Waste Collections;
  - Waste Processing – Delivered from Lamby Way Deport, MRF and Landfill;
  - Waste Strategy;
  - Business Support;
  - Stores Support & Development;

- Resource Co-ordinators.
5. This item will provide Members with an opportunity to review the impact that the Covid crisis has had upon the services (above) and capital projects relevant to the Waste Management Service. The Cabinet Member and the Assistant Director for Street Scene have agreed to attend the meeting to support the briefing, which will include:
- The budget position of the Waste Management Service as a whole, along with a summary of individual service parts;
  - How the Waste Management Service has performed against its performance objectives during the Covid crisis;
  - A summary of the main challenges that the Waste Management Service has faced during the Covid crisis;
  - A summary of the main opportunities that the Waste Management Service has identified during the Covid crisis;
  - An update on new and existing capital projects relevant to the Waste Management Service;
  - A summary of key future proposals relevant to the Waste Management Service.

### **Way Forward**

6. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment has been invited to attend the meeting. He will be supported by officers from the Assistant Director for Street Scene.

### **Legal Implications**

7. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to the Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be

within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

### **Financial Implications**

8. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

9. The Committee is recommended to:
  - (i) Consider the information in this report and the information presented at the meeting;
  - (ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter; and,
  - (iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

**Davina Fiore**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**30<sup>th</sup> September 2020**

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**6 OCTOBER 2020**

---

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE – WORK PROGRAMME  
PLANNING 2020/21**

---

**Background**

1. The Constitution states that each Scrutiny Committee will set their own work programme. This is traditionally undertaken at the beginning of a municipal year and updated as the work progresses, however, due to the current Covid crisis the start of the process for 2020/21 has been delayed. As with other years, the work programme needs to be carefully constructed so that the time available to the Committee is used most effectively.
2. The Environmental Scrutiny Committee's Terms of Reference provide the Committee with the responsibility for the scrutiny of a number of specific service areas. A copy of the terms of reference has been attached to this document as **Appendix 1**. This will remind Members of the scope of ideas that could be considered.
3. The Committee is responsible for the scrutiny of a number of policies and strategies that affect the sustainability and environment of Cardiff. It can also undertake investigations into any of these areas.
4. The construction of a work programme involves obtaining information from a range of sources, these may include:
  - Information from the relevant Directorate;
  - Relevant extracts from the current Corporate Plan;

- Suggestions and ideas put forward by the previous Environmental Scrutiny Committee;
  - Member suggestions and observations;
  - Citizen and third party comments and observations;
  - Performance information.
5. The topics gathered from the sources identified above have been recorded in a document titled 'Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Potential Work Programme Items 2020/21'. This document has been provided to Members to help them prioritise items for the Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Work Programme 2020/21 and is attached to this report as **Appendix 2**.
6. The topics in **Appendix 2** have been broken down by a number of themes / areas relevant to the terms of reference of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee. The themes are:
- Transport;
  - Energy Schemes;
  - Highways (including Parking Management);
  - Planning;
  - Shared Regulatory Service;
  - Cleansing & Waste Management;
  - Bereavement & Registration Services;
  - Other;
  - Mandatory Items.
7. The Committee will also need to agree the format and type of scrutiny to be undertaken, examples include:
- **Policy Development & Review** – Where the Committee contributes to the Council's policy development processes by considering draft policy documents or existing policies.
  - **Inquiries** – Where the Committee undertakes an examination of a topic over a period of time, via a task & finish group, resulting in a formal report to the

Cabinet. These can be short inquiries, such as deep dives, or longer inquiries, as required.

- **Short Scrutiny Studies** – Where the Committee examines a particular service or issue over one or two committee meetings. Frequently such scrutiny activity results in a letter being sent to the relevant Cabinet Member with recommendations or comments.
- **Pre Decision** – Where the Committee evaluates and comments on proposals before they go to the Cabinet, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to reflect upon Scrutiny views prior to making their decision.
- **Monitoring Performance & Progress** – Where the Committee undertakes monitoring of the Council's performance and progress in implementing actions previously agreed.

8. When developing a scrutiny work programme it is important prioritise where work resources are allocated. This means that items should be prioritised to ensure quality over quantity, achievability, deliverability and impact. In following this approach items should:

- **Focus** – Be based on issues that impact on Cardiff citizens.
- **Add Value** – Where possible enhance the work of the Council in delivering services to our citizens.
- **Involve** - Involve partners, stakeholders and the public in scrutiny process.
- **Demonstrate Flexibility** – The work programme should be reviewed regularly to reflect changing priorities.
- **Agreed by Committee** – Work programme items should be agreed by the whole Committee working as a team.
- **Thematic** – The Committee should consider wider issues rather than only focusing on Council services.
- **Balance** – The work programme should be balanced and include items from across the terms of reference.

- **Team work** – In delivering the work programme councillors should leave party politics at the door, work as a team and focus on wider issues that impact on all Cardiff citizens.
9. Once the Member priorities are agreed then the Chair will meet with the Principal Scrutiny Officer to review the items and place these into a draft work programme. The 'Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Draft Work Programme 2020/21' will be tabled as an item at the Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting on the 3<sup>rd</sup> November. At this point it is hoped that the Committee will, subject to any potential alterations, agree the work programme for the period November 2020 to March 2021. The Environmental Scrutiny Committee work programme will be reviewed and updated during the 2020/21 municipal year to reflect resources and changing priorities.
  10. In setting their work programme, Members have been mindful of Wales Audit Office advice for scrutiny committees to aim to achieve committee meetings that last no longer than three hours, whilst maintaining robust and appropriate levels of scrutiny across the terms of reference, by ensuring agendas are of a manageable size and that work occurs outside committee meetings. Members agreed in principle with this approach and agreed to aim to achieve this, with the option to adjourn a committee meeting if more time is required than originally anticipated. This is particularly relevant during the Covid crisis as meetings will be held remotely.

### **Way Forward**

11. Members should consider the list of potential topics contained within **Appendix 2**, and agree a number of work programme priorities for the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Work Programme 2020/21.

### **Legal Implications**

12. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to



Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

### **Financial Implications**

13. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

The Committee is recommended to:

- i. Consider the contents of this report; and,
- ii. Agree a number of priorities for the work programme.

**DAVINA FIORE**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**30<sup>th</sup> September 2020**

This page is intentionally left blank

### Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Terms of Reference

The role of this Committee is to scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of environmental sustainability including:

- Strategic Planning Policy
- Sustainability Policy
- Environmental Health Policy
- Public Protection Policy
- Licensing Policy
- Waste Management
- Strategic Waste Projects
- Street Cleansing
- Cycling and Walking
- Streetscape
- Strategic Transportation Partnership
- Transport Policy and Development
- Intelligent Transport Solutions
- Public Transport
- Parking Management

To assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies and quasi-departmental nongovernmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.

To report to an appropriate Cabinet or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures which may enhance Council performance and service delivery in this area.

This page is intentionally left blank

## List of Potential Work Programme Items – 2020/21

### Transport

- Planning for Sustainable Transport Routes, Council Vehicles & Active Travel – Short to Medium Term
- Cardiff's Bus Routes & Services - Update
- Development of Cardiff's Future Transport Interchanges - Update
- Cardiff Cycling Review – Participation & Infrastructure
- Castle Street Option Review & Tender Award
- Taxi Services – Review
- South Wales Metro Update (including new stations at Loudoun Square, in the heart of Cardiff Bay, Crwys Road and Roath Park by 2024; establishing a new mainline train station at Cardiff Parkway in St Mellons by 2023)
- Eastern Bay Link Road
- Cardiff Bus Strategy 2020 (including a new cross-city bus interchange at Waungron Road, providing connections to the University Hospital of Wales and linking to the east of the city by 2021)
- Development of New Park & Ride Facilities
- City Centre Transport Masterplan Projects - 2020 to 2022
- Active Travel Network Map 2021
- Roll out 20mph Speed Limits by 2022
- Nextbike Cardiff Expansion & E-bike Fleet Roll Out
- Cardiff Schools Active Travel Plans
- Healthy Streets Pilot & Impact Assessment

### Energy & Sustainability

- One Planet Cardiff
- Lamby Way Solar Farm – Member Update
- Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update
- Cardiff's Electric Vehicles Strategy
- Implementation of Low Emission Fuels Strategy
- Cardiff Food Strategy – Progress Update

### Highways (including Parking Management)

- Parking Provision Review Undertake - Protecting Local Residents from Long Stay Commuter Parking & Support Local Neighbourhoods – Combine Parking Strategy
- Highways Resurfacing Programme
- Coastal Flood Management Project – Update
- Cardiff Sustainable Water, Flood & Drainage Strategy - 2021
- Development of the Canal Quarter Scheme by 2022
- Parking Management Update

### Planning

- Cardiff Local Development Plan – Full Review
- Fourth Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report
- Llandaff Conservation Area Review
- Best Practice in Sustainable Planning Policy
- Practicalities of Applying Planning Policy Wales 10
- Delivering Cardiff's Green Infrastructure Plan

### Shared Regulatory Service

- Shared Regulatory Service Annual Report 2020/21 & Business Plan 2021/22
- Air Quality Improvements – Achieving Statutory Compliance
- Local Air Quality Management - Annual Air Quality Progress Report

### Cleansing & Waste Management

- Waste Collection Productivity (suggested that this could potentially be transferred to PRAP or undertaken as a joint scrutiny with PRAP)
- City Wide Separate Glass Recycling
- Review of Waste Collection Rounds (Routes, Staffing & Vehicles)
- Waste Management Strategy – Update
- Assessment of Recycling Performance

### **Bereavement & Registration Services**

- Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision
- Thornhill Cemetery Development – Progress Update
- Cardiff Dogs Home - Relocation or Refurbishment
- Western Cemetery Memorial Garden

### **Other**

- Response to Scrutiny report Managing Biodiversity

### **Mandatory Items**

- Draft Budget Proposals 2021/22
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarterly Performance
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Directorate Delivery Plan 2021/22

This page is intentionally left blank



**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**06 OCTOBER 2020**

---

**ONE PLANET CARDIFF – MEMBER BRIEFING NOTE**

---

**Reason for the Report**

1. To provide the Committee with an update on the proposals contained within the report titled ‘One Planet Cardiff – A Response to the Climate Change Emergency’, and to discuss how best the Committee can provide constructive input into the six-month consultation period.
2. The report will be received at the Cabinet meeting on the 17<sup>th</sup> October, and it is anticipated that it will recommend that Cabinet:
  - *Approve the vision set out in the One Planet Cardiff Strategy for Cardiff to become a carbon neutral city by 2030;*
  - *Authorise a period of public consultation on the strategy and bring the One Planet Cardiff Strategy and Action Plan back to Cabinet in due course for approval.*

**Background**

3. The reason for the Cabinet report titled ‘One Planet Cardiff – A Response to the Climate Change Crisis’ is to approve the One Planet Cardiff Strategy as the Council’s initial response to the declared Climate Emergency, and to authorise a period of public consultation to help shape a final strategy and action plan for approval in Spring 2021.
4. It is broadly accepted that Climate Change remains the defining global challenge of our generation. The impacts of climate change, including rising sea levels, flood risk, extreme weather events, unsustainable energy supplies and ultimately, widespread economic instability, are putting tens of millions of people and their jobs across the globe at direct risk. These issues are already affecting the Cardiff area, and its

population. The Council's actions in the coming decade are crucial; they will define the shape and wellbeing of our society and our planet for generations to come.

5. The climate change issue is not just about environment and carbon neutrality, but has clear implications for our society and economy. The approach of the One Planet Cardiff strategy is to identify the fundamental interdependency of these issues and, in doing so, to identify the real opportunity for positive action and improvement to create a society and economy that is successful, resilient, sustainable and well-being focussed in the long term.
6. The Council has recognised the scale of this challenge and declared a Climate Emergency. The One Planet Cardiff Strategy has been prepared as a strategic response to this declaration. It contains a vision that:
  - Sets out the Council's 10 year ambition to be Carbon Neutral in its own activities;
  - Calls on partners and stakeholders to work with us to develop a City-Wide road map and action plan for a carbon neutral City by 2030;
  - Identifies opportunities that could reframe the Cardiff economy in a way that is resilient, robust and long-term, ensuring that Cardiff is one of the leading UK green cities; and,
  - Defines the immediate programmes and opportunities that we urgently need to address.
7. The document analyses the scope and scale of the challenge facing the Council and the City, and also highlights the opportunities that could arise from positive action to address this challenge. It outlines the significant progress that the Council has made to date to address its carbon footprint, and then proposes a wide range of immediate and potential actions that will form the basis of its longer term response to the climate emergency.
8. The development of the strategy coincided with the Covid-19 emergency (and the resulting public health and emerging economic crises that have resulted in turn from this), and it is clear that the two emergencies, and the Council's response, cannot be mutually exclusive.

9. Cardiff's recovery response to Covid-19 has already established some key resilience principles. The administration's Capital Ambition, of building a fairer, greener, more prosperous city is more important now than ever. The development of the One Planet Cardiff Strategy has therefore had a renewed focus, highlighting projects and opportunities that can stimulate a "Green Recovery", with the Council leading a capital city that will be at the forefront of a green and inclusive economy, supporting both environmental and economic recovery in Wales.
10. The Council plans to consult widely on the draft Strategy to help prioritise actions, and to gather support for a whole-city response. At the same time, the Council will be seeking to generate a better and more consistent means of analysing its carbon and climate impacts across all of its activities, generating an evidence base and more detailed project feasibility work to prioritise and measure the impact of its actions.
11. The consultation analysis process will then inform a detailed committed action plan that will be approved later in the spring 2021. However, given the urgency of this agenda the Council won't wait until then to move forward, and so the Strategy also highlights the immediate actions, business case development, engagement with strategic partners, and quick wins that the Council is already putting in place to address the Climate Emergency.

## **Issues**

### ***Background Policy***

12. There is a range of live and well-publicised international and national policy surrounding the Climate Change agenda. This includes:
  - The International Paris Accord 2015, which seeks to keep global temperature increases well below 2 degrees;
  - The Welsh Government's Wellbeing of Future Generations Act 2015, which requires public bodies in Wales to consider the long term impacts of all their key decisions;
  - Welsh Government's 2019 ambition for a Carbon Neutral Public Sector in Wales by 2030; and,

- The UK Government's 2019 policy for Net-Zero Greenhouse Gases in the UK by 2050.
13. In light of the assertions and warnings of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, the Council declared a 'Climate Emergency' on 28 March 2019. The Council is not alone; so far over 250 other councils across the UK have also motioned a declaration, alongside the Welsh and UK Government.
  14. The risks associated with climate change are significant and well known. Many, including rising sea levels, extreme weather, increased pollution and associated public health implications are already being experienced in Cardiff, and will in some cases make the Council's services more difficult and more expensive to deliver. However, a consolidated approach to tackle climate change could bring opportunities, making the city a healthier, safer and more competitive place, and underpinned by a thriving green economy.
  15. Estimates are that Cardiff is currently a three-planet city, this means that if everyone in the world consumed natural resources and generated carbon dioxide at the rate we do in Cardiff, we would need three planets to support us. This is not sustainable for us, or equitable to those we share the planet with, however, the answer is not simply to consume less but rather to operate better, enabling activity that is smarter, more energy efficient and environmentally positive.
  16. The Council's aspiration is to become a One Planet City, living within its environmental means, but with a thriving and dynamic economy, a healthy population and high quality city environment that ensures Cardiff is among the greenest in the UK.

### ***Progress to Date***

17. The Council has a good starting position for this agenda that puts Cardiff among the best UK cities for green and smart development, for instance:
  - It has achieved a 49% reduction in carbon emissions from our estate in the last 5 years;
  - It has installed energy efficiency measures in almost 10,000 homes since 2013;

- It has installed over 2MW of renewable energy generation on our estate;
- It has installed over 20 on-street electric vehicle charging points in the city, are converting 90 council fleet vehicles to electric and have put in place Planning Guidance that encourages EV infrastructure in all major new development.
- It has helped to deliver the first-of-a-kind “Greener Grangetown” sustainable drainage scheme;
- It is in contract to build 2,000 affordable homes in the city, all exceeding national energy standards; and,
- It has approved an ambitious Transport White Paper to facilitate a significant and sustainable shift in how people move around the city.

18. The Council also has other ambitious projects that are already approved and in progress, these include:

- A 9MW solar farm which is nearing completion;
- Fully funded plans for a low-carbon heat network in the Bay and City Centre, using energy from waste in place of fossil fuels;
- Pilot schemes to develop a zero carbon schools and a Passivhaus standard housing estate;
- A fast, safe and fully segregated cycle network of a further 5 cycleways across the city; and,
- A Sustainable Food Strategy.

19. However, the Council understands that it needs to do more, quickly and in collaboration with others, if it is to tackle the Climate Emergency.

### ***Areas of Focus***

20. The One Planet Cardiff Strategy will identify a very broad ranging programme which could position Cardiff as a UK leader in a climate responsive economy, shaping environmental solutions to deliver benefits for business and the wider city as well the new skills and jobs that will be crucial to deliver this change.

21. The draft strategy focuses on seven key themes. The Council’s current progress is identified for each theme, along with a series of planned and potential actions that it is considering for the next phase of work. The key themes are:

- **Energy:** This includes how energy is used, how it is sourced, distributed and generated. The Council aim is to use less, to source more from clean renewable generation, and to help build business around this growing sector.
- **Built Environment and Housing Quality:** This comprises existing and planned buildings and infrastructure. The Council needs to constantly improve the energy efficiency and resilience of our new and existing buildings and communities, and capture the skills and jobs required to achieve this for the benefit of the local economy.
- **Green Infrastructure:** This covers our integral green spaces and biodiversity. The Council needs to take bold steps to add to the natural green assets of the city making a healthy, clean, biodiverse, environmentally positive place in which citizens and business can thrive.
- **Transport:** This covers how we move around the city and the infrastructure required to minimise the impact of vehicle emissions and air quality. The Council's plans are to replace as many single user, fossil fuelled trips as possible with sustainable low carbon modes of travel.
- **Waste Management:** By reducing overall waste production and by recycling residual waste in the right way, the Council can help to reduce Cardiff's carbon footprint. The Council also recognises that certain waste can be an important low carbon energy source helping to build new, clean, local and resilient economic activity.
- **Food:** The production, transportation, processing and disposal of food is a major source of emissions and the Council's proposals are aimed at supporting smarter, more localised and more socially equitable food systems that can also boost the local food economy.
- **Water:** How the Council sources, uses and manages water, and how it can protect against drought and flooding is crucial to the aim of building climate resilience. The strategy outlines a series of current and future responses to this challenge.

22. Furthermore, there are also a series of cross-cutting areas in which the Council understands that it needs to act, these are:

- **Leading City Economy & Development** - The Council needs a stronger focus on growing a sustainable local economy. This includes ensuring that Cardiff has the right skills to achieve and maintain a successful carbon neutral city, with new jobs and security created in the post-Covid-19 landscape.
- **Collaboration** - The Council cannot do this alone. It needs citywide support from engaged citizens, communities, organisations, businesses and academia.
- **Finance** – This is crucial, as significant investment and funding will be needed to create a carbon neutral Cardiff by 2030. The Council needs to invest to save, bring carbon into our cost equations, and explore all sources of support and grant funding, recognising that doing nothing will ultimately cost more than positive action now.
- **Governance** - Bold collaborative leadership is required. Climate impact and carbon emissions will need to have a more central place in decision-making activities, and be appropriately integrated amongst other priorities.
- **Engagement & Behaviour Change** - The Council needs to get the right messages out to stakeholders, ensuring that we're all making well informed, climate responsive choices.
- **Procurement** - The Council's spending activities can have a huge carbon impact across all operational areas. It needs a more focussed oversight to ensure that it is buying the right things in the right way, and to identify small changes that can deliver positively for the climate emergency whilst also supporting the right sort of business.
- **Digital** - Capacity underpins our ability to deliver many of our objectives and targets, especially in communications and in measuring and monitoring progress.

- **Regulation & Policy** - This needs to be fit for purpose in the context of the climate change emergency, and the Council needs to highlight and seek change in areas that fall short.

23. The One Planet Cardiff Strategy will contain details of the various projects, plans and aspirations that could help to deliver real change in respect of each of these issues.

### ***Next Steps***

24. The Strategy sets out the overarching vision for the Council's Climate Emergency response, bringing together the Council's many recent and current actions, alongside proposing projects that will set us on a path to carbon neutrality.

### ***A Fairer, Greener, More Prosperous City***

25. The diverse range of projects in the Strategy, especially in the context of the Covid-19 emergency, highlight a series of clear opportunities to support a Green Recovery. The projects listed below are those that the Council knows that it has to focus on in the short-term, and it will develop business cases and implementation plans for these during the consultation process so that it can be ready to respond early. It is important to recognise that the scale of some of the projects proposed is significant. Therefore, it will be essential to understand this process with key regional and national partners. Some of the proposals are within the Council's direct control, whilst others will require co-ordinated city, regional or even national effort. They include:

- **Largescale Housing & Development Retrofit:** Under-insulated housing is a major source of community (fuel) poverty, health conditions exacerbated by cold and damp homes, poor air quality and energy wastage across the city. Upscaling and accelerating work to make existing homes more energy efficient and comfortable not only addresses this, but could also stimulate new areas for skills development and employment. The Council will be developing its ideas and funding proposals on this to present to prospective delivery partners who could assist us in realising this ambition, possibly at a regional or national scale.
- **Resilient Development:** The Council will be moving forward with a range of planning policy and guidance to facilitate and maximise low energy, resource



efficient and resilient development across the city. It will lead by example, in its own and partners construction activities.

- **Low Cost Efficient Energy:** The Council will investigate a new pipeline of clean energy generation schemes in the city, developing detailed business cases for those that are the most promising. It will investigate all of the potential local opportunities, including potential tidal power, so that it can fully understand the Council's facilitating role in some of the more challenging but potentially beneficial projects. A Cardiff tidal lagoon could deliver a strategically important volume of sustainable energy for the National Grid, as well as providing energy for the city, creating jobs, providing flood risk mitigation, and acting as a catalyst for a wider green energy cluster in the city region. Cardiff, and its city region leadership role, has the potential to lead on the development and application of new green technologies, putting the city at the forefront of the UK's low carbon transition.
- **Low Energy Active Transport:** The Council's sustainable/active travel projects are increasingly visible across the city, having the co-benefits of reducing carbon emissions, and reducing congestion in the city that may also increase economic productivity. The Council also believes that there is an opportunity to support the early roll-out of Ultra Low Emission Vehicles in our fleet and across the city, and charging infrastructure. It has a number of potential projects relating to EV infrastructure, localised hydrogen fuel production, and supporting wider access to Electric Car Clubs. It will assess and promote the partnership and funding structures that will be needed to deliver the best of these.
- **Greening the City:** Increased tree coverage and smarter maintenance and planting regimes will form important features of a future low carbon Cardiff. Ideas for a City Tree Farm concept, and biodiversity friendly land management could help to deliver this, and might also bring new skills and employment. The Council will examine the business models required to bring these aspirations to life.
- **Low Carbon Affordable Healthy Food:** The Covid-19 lockdown highlighted the imbalance in access to healthy, local, and affordable food. The Council has already had great examples of Local Food Pantries providing better access to food for those in need, alongside the increasingly sophisticated methods available

to deliver sustainable Urban Farming. The Council is currently analysing how its underused land assets and procurement activities (especially in feeding thousands of school children) could be used to support an enlarged sustainable food economy for the city.

- **Procurement:** The Council's annual spend is significant. It has a direct impact on the local economy and the associated activities generate a large carbon footprint in their own right. The Council will be instigating "circular economy" training for specifiers so that our contracts are more accountable for their climate consequences, and will also start to investigate procurement policies which could attract more suppliers that are able to deliver lower carbon goods and services.

26. Across all of these projects the Council will be focused on developing an understanding of further dependencies and opportunities that arise from the new economic activity required to deliver a low carbon city, thereby helping to establish Cardiff as a UK leading Green Economy.

### ***Consultation***

27. The Council now plans to conduct a consultation on the proposed actions in the Strategy, and will be seeking views to help shape and prioritise a full action plan for approval next year. A consultation programme, addressing both the public and local businesses and organisations has been developed to support this and will go live in October 2020. It is proposed that the consultation includes both feedback questionnaires, and informative video clips to ensure that some of the more complex messages and aspirations can be communicated clearly.

### ***Accelerating our Response***

28. The Council will be putting in place some immediate measures to underline the urgency of the issues. In doing this the Council will:
- Organise an internal One Planet Cardiff Steering Group, led by Cabinet Members and attended by Senior Officials from areas across the Council;
  - Initiate effective outline business case development, defining the resources and governance required, with key partners for the key programmes. The Council's

initial priorities will focus on housing retrofit, resilient development policy, increased local renewable energy, clean transport, city greening, sustainable food and procurement activities;

- Work with the Public Service Board to bring together existing carbon reduction plans of all public sector organisations in the City, identifying synergies and gaps, and agreeing a position statement on which to base a city wide collaborative action plan;
- Instigate further studies to generate a better picture of our total carbon footprint and to develop robust methods to help prioritise the most cost effective and impactful projects, and to monitor progress more clearly;
- Begin an appraisal of our internal governance and procurement processes to ensure that carbon and climate impacts are embedded appropriately in Council procedures.

29. These parallel processes will all contribute to the production of a final One Planet Cardiff Strategy and Action Plan, which will include a prioritised list of short, medium and long terms actions. This will be brought back to Cabinet for approval in the spring 2021.

### **Way Forward**

30. Members will be asked to note the content of this Member Briefing Note, and agree a way forward for scrutiny of One Planet Cardiff within the six-month consultation window.

### **Legal Implications**

31. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to the Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be

within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

### **Financial Implications**

32. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

33. The Committee is recommended to:
- (i) Consider the information in this report and the information presented at the meeting;
  - (ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter; and,
  - (iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

**Davina Fiore**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**30<sup>th</sup> September 2020**

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**06 OCTOBER 2020**

---

**HOUSING RETROFIT – LOCAL AUTHORITY FLEXIBLE ELIGIBILITY FOR ECO’ –  
MEMBER BRIEFING NOTE**

---

**Reason for the Report**

1. To provide the Committee with a Member Briefing Note on the content of the Cabinet report titled ‘Housing Retrofit – Local Authority Flexible Eligibility for Eco’, which is due to be presented at the Cabinet meeting on the 17<sup>th</sup> October. The document looks to approve and publish a “Statement of Intent” for the Council to use the Government’s “Local Authority Flexible Eligibility for ECO”, so that fuel poor households from the Rent Smart Wales Warm Homes Fund project, and potential future projects of a similar nature, can benefit from additional private sector funding to improve their homes.
2. It is anticipated that the report will recommend that Cabinet:
  - Approve the Cardiff Council Flexible Eligibility for ECO Statement of Intent; and,
  - Authority be delegated to the Director for Planning, Transport & Environment to 1) make arrangements for discharging the functions under the Statement of Intent and authorising officers to sign Declarations; and, 2) in consultation with the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling and Environment, make changes to the Statement of Intent as necessary and to carry out the process for implementing such changes.

**Background**

Energy Company Obligation

3. The Energy Company Obligation (ECO) is a government energy efficiency scheme that aims to help deliver energy efficiency retrofit measures in domestic properties in

the UK. It is funded through a tax payable by energy companies, which is in turn raised via customer bills.

4. The scheme aims to tackle fuel poverty and reduce carbon emissions.
5. ECO began in April 2013, and over time its various detailed terms and targets have been amended. The latest policy, ECO3, commenced in December 2018 and is due to run until March 2022.
6. A private sector household (owner occupied or private sector rental) qualifies for ECO funding if they are in receipt of qualifying benefits and where the household income is below a set cap. ECO funding is obtained from Energy Suppliers direct, or more often via an intermediary, who organises and oversees the retrofit of the property. The funding covers a proportion of the cost of the retrofit, which is dependent upon the measure installed and the energy efficiency of the property prior to retrofit. The surplus is paid by the property owner (owner occupier or private sector landlord).
7. Social housing with an Energy Performance Certificate (EPC) rating of E, F or G qualifies for ECO funding regardless of the tenants benefits eligibility. Local Authorities can become involved in this aspect of ECO if their housing stock qualifies for funding. Cardiff utilises this funding for its housing stock, where applicable, via the insulation contractor in place.

#### LA Flex

8. To encourage wider uptake of ECO funding the government has introduced a mechanism to allow local authorities to facilitate ECO works under a scheme called Local Authority Flexible Eligibility for ECO (LA Flex).
9. The benefits of local authority involvement in LA Flex include:
  - More widespread and targeted local marketing of the opportunity for grant funding to increase uptake;
  - The ability to set bespoke, area-specific qualifying criteria beyond the basics set out above, to cover more households in fuel poverty in the area; and,

- Developing an approved list of suppliers to achieve better quality control, both of the customer journey and works undertaken to potentially vulnerable households.
10. Households qualifying for LA Flex still need to be living in fuel poverty or a household living on a low income and vulnerable to the effects of living in a cold home.
  11. LA Flex only applies to private sector households (owner occupied or private rental).
  12. Participation in the LA Flex scheme would potentially assist Cardiff households in fuel poverty, and supports one of the key short term ambitions of the One Planet Cardiff Strategy which is to seek ways to upscale domestic energy retrofit in the city and stimulate the economic recovery.
  13. The Council currently retrofits a few hundred homes a year but to fulfil the One Planet Cardiff Strategy ambition this needs to increase to be thousands; LA Flex could be one of the mechanisms to help achieve this upscaling of delivery. LA Flex is aimed at households on low incomes and living in the least energy efficient homes. In Cardiff approximately a third of households have an income of £20,000 and below, and approximately 45% of the city's housing stock is energy inefficient (Energy Performance Certificate (EPC) band D and below) with 15% being very energy inefficient properties (EPC band E and below). Extrapolated this could mean that between 25,000 to 50,000 households in Cardiff potentially qualify for LA Flex funding.

#### Statement of Intent

14. To widen the criteria under LA Flex the local authority needs to approve and publish a Statement of Intent (SOI) detailing household qualifying criteria and how to access funding (i.e. detailing the Council's procured intermediaries / installers if this is the route taken). Local authorities participating under LA Flex are expected to follow the published BEIS guidance 'Energy Company Obligation: ECO3 2018-22 Flexible Eligibility Guidance'.

## How it Works

15. A local authority can change the SOI criteria as and when required but needs to approve and publish each version. A new version of the SOI supersedes all previous versions.
16. Once the SOI is published Energy Suppliers or their intermediaries (eg energy installers) can submit householder details to the local authority to request that a Declaration be issued if they qualify for potential funding.
17. The local authority Declaration is a statement in writing that a household is eligible for support under LA Flex. To issue the Declaration the local authority has to have seen evidence that demonstrates the household fulfils the qualifying criteria detailed in the SOI.
18. Only local authorities can sign and issue Declarations. The SOI must detail a named officer who will sign and issue these Declarations. The named officer is also responsible for reporting back to the Department for Business, Energy & Industrial Strategy on the number and details of Declarations issued.
19. Meeting the Council's LA Flex criteria and the issuing of a Declaration does not guarantee the installation of energy efficiency measures. The final decision will lie with the Energy Supplier that is providing the funding.

## **Issues**

### Resources and quality control

20. Cardiff has not issued a SOI to date due to resource issues, and concern over the quality control of retrofit installations. Experience of other local authorities is that the issuing of the SOI entails a full time resource to manage the process correctly and effectively. Where schemes have been run without proper resource this has resulted in issues and complaints from residents, local installers and BEIS.
21. The SOI can be open to all Energy Suppliers and their intermediaries, which is likely to result in a high volume of applications for eligibility and resulting Declarations to be issued. However, local authorities can add in an element of control by undertaking a



procurement process to contract companies with ECO funding agreements in place who fulfil quality criteria around the customer journey and retrofit measures installed. Intermediaries procured via this exercise would then be listed on the Council website alongside the published SOI so that a clear route to funding is available to both residents and installers.

22. A more controlled approach is recommended, both to avoid overwhelming resources and to ensure quality of installers and resultant works. Additionally it would be prudent to undertake a pilot LA Flex project prior to committing to a fuller procurement exercise.
23. Therefore, it is proposed that the existing Rent Smart Wales Warm Homes Fund project is utilised as a pilot for LA Flex. This will enable the Council to evaluate the success and eventual resources required for a wider LA Flex scheme.

#### LA Flex pilot project

24. Rent Smart Wales are currently coordinating the Warm Homes Fund project for private sector housing across Wales. The project aims to install first time central heating to approx. 275 of the poorest energy performing private rental homes in Wales. The project will prioritise the most inefficient homes blending a number of funding sources including ECO, Warm Homes Funding and individual landlord contributions.
25. Rent Smart Wales have been through a procurement exercise to engage a project delivery partner, with the successful company being YES Energy Solutions. YES Energy Solutions have ECO3 funding contracts with 5 Energy Suppliers, enabling them to access ECO funding including the LA Flex element for local authority areas where there is a SOI in place. Utilising LA Flex for eligible properties could help stretch the project funding further and, for the purposes of the pilot, could rely on existing resources.
26. On this basis a SOI has been drafted for the specific and exclusive purposes of assisting the current Rent Smart Wales project. The qualifying criteria includes both fuel poverty and health issues. This is based on the BEIS Guidance and has been agreed as suitable by BEIS. The SOI states that the following can submit

applications for Declarations: 'YES Energy Solutions for the Rent Smart Wales Warm Homes Fund project and companies who have been procured by Cardiff Council for the purpose of enabling ECO funding for private sector households'.

27. This would enable LA Flex to be utilised on a pilot basis within the Rent Smart Wales Warm Homes Fund project for us to assess the likely resources that might be required to expand to other schemes in the future should the resource issues be identified. The Rent Smart Wales pilot is limited to only private rental properties and small numbers within Cardiff as the 275 first time central heating installs are to be spread across Wales. However, this pilot could be the springboard to something much larger; as noted previously if LA Flex is opened out to all private tenure households in Cardiff (owner occupied and private rental) then between 25,000 and 50,000 households in Cardiff could potentially qualify for Declarations.
28. It is proposed that authority be delegated to the Director for Planning, Transport & Environment to define and authorise future revisions to the SOI so that this can be a swift process that reacts to funding opportunities as they arise. The types of revisions anticipated include amending the household income thresholds annually in line with inflation, and changing the named officer that signs off the Declarations.
29. The Energy Company Obligation is due to run until 2029, although ECO3 ends in March 2022. Industry anticipates that LA Flex will continue into ECO4, although at this time Government have not confirmed this.

### **Financial Implications**

30. The 'Financial Implications' contained within the draft Cabinet report explain that:  
*By utilising the existing Rent Smart Wales Warm Homes project as the basis for a LA Flex pilot project financial implications can be contained within existing resources. Results from the pilot project will need to be reviewed to identify if there would be any further resources requirements, and how these could be funded, from a scaling-up of the Council's facilitator role for this initiative.*

### **Legal Implications (including Equality Impact Assessment where appropriate)**

31. The 'Legal Implications' contained within the draft Cabinet report explain that:

*If any procurement is undertaken, such procurement will need to be in accordance with the council's contract procedure rules and applicable procurement regulations. With reference to the contract in the report, legal services are instructed that the contract allows the project referred to.*

### **Way Forward**

32. Members will be asked to note the content of this Member Briefing Note, and decide if any further scrutiny is required on the matter.

### **Legal Implications**

33. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to the Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

### **Financial Implications**

34. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to

Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

35. The Committee is recommended to:
- (i) Consider the information in this report and the information presented at the meeting;
  - (ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter; and,
  - (iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

**Davina Fiore**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**30<sup>th</sup> September 2020**

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE:**

**06 OCTOBER 2020**

---

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE – DRAFT ANNUAL REPORT 2019/20**

---

**Background**

1. The Cardiff Council Constitution requires all Scrutiny Committees to ‘report annually to the Council on their workings and make recommendations for future work programmes and amended working methods if appropriate’.
2. A copy of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee’s draft Annual Report 2019/20 is attached at **Appendix 1**. This report outlines the Committee’s main activities undertaken during the 2019/20 Municipal Year. The year’s work has been set out under the following headings:
  - Briefing Information;
  - Inquiries;
  - Performance Monitoring;
  - Policy Review;
  - Pre – Decision Scrutiny.
3. The report concludes by setting out topics by scrutiny type that have been covered by the Environmental Scrutiny Committee during the 2019/20 municipal year. In addition to this, the Committee will have the opportunity to identify suitable priorities for the 2020/21 Environmental Scrutiny Committee work programme.
4. A copy of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Draft Annual Report 2019/20 was considered at the 15<sup>th</sup> September meeting. At this meeting Members asked that the report was updated to reflect the impact of the Committee during 2019/20. During this item Members will have an opportunity to decide which of the suggestions put forward should be included within the final version of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Annual Report 2019/20.

## **Legal Implications**

5. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

## **Financial Implications**

6. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

## **Recommendation**

The Committee is recommended to consider, if necessary amend, and approve the attached Environmental Scrutiny Committee Annual Report 2019/20 for presentation to Council.

**DAVINA FIORE**

**Director of Governance & Legal Services**

**30<sup>th</sup> September 2020**



# **A Report of: Environmental Scrutiny Committee**

## **Annual Report 2019 – 2020**

**May 2020**



**City and County of Cardiff**

## ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Ramesh Patel  
(Chairperson)



Councillor Bob Derbyshire



Councillor Owen Jones



Councillor John Lancaster



Councillor Oliver Owen



Councillor Thomas Parkhill



Councillor Jacqueline Parry



Councillor Peter Wong



Councillor Ashley Wood

**Note:** Councillor Joe Boyle was a Member of this Committee until November 2019.



## CHAIR'S FOREWORD



**Councillor Ramesh Patel**

**Chairperson - Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee**

DRAFT

## INTRODUCTION

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of transport, sustainability, and waste.

This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2019/20. Between June 2019 and May 2020 the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Briefing Information** – Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject that has environmental implications to the Council and the city. During 2019/20 examples included:
  - Highway Resurfacing Programme – Member Briefing Note (**1st October 2019**)
  - Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update (**1st October 2019**)
  - Informal Waste Management Briefing (**5<sup>th</sup> November 2019**)
  - National Development Framework – Member Briefing Note (**20<sup>th</sup> November 2019**)
  - Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan – Member Briefing Note (**20<sup>th</sup> November 2020**)
  - Member Briefing Note: Fireworks (**3<sup>rd</sup> March 2020**)
  - Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019 (**3<sup>rd</sup> March 2020**)
- **Inquiries** – Where the Committee had undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. During 2018/19 examples included:
  - Draft Task & Finish Report – Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff (**20<sup>th</sup> November 2019**)

- Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' (**21<sup>st</sup> January 2020**)
- Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff' (**March 3<sup>rd</sup> 2020**)
- **Performance Monitoring** – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance. During 2018/19 examples included:
  - Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (**17<sup>th</sup> September 2019**)
  - Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20 (**1<sup>st</sup> October 2019**)
  - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20<sup>th</sup> November 2020**)
  - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20<sup>th</sup> November 2020**)
  - Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19 (**3<sup>rd</sup> March 2020**)
  - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20<sup>th</sup> November 2020**)
- **Policy Review** - Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example, by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required.
- **Pre Decision Scrutiny** – This provides the Committee with an opportunity to evaluate and comment on policy proposals before they go to the Council's Cabinet. This gives the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision. During 2019/20 examples included:

- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements **(12<sup>th</sup> June 2019)**
- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy **(2<sup>nd</sup> July 2019)**
- Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision – **(17<sup>th</sup> September 2019)**
- Cardiff's Transport White Paper **(21<sup>st</sup> January 2020)**
- Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance – **(21<sup>st</sup> January 2020)**
- Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 – Corporate Overview **(17<sup>th</sup> February 2020)**
- Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 & 2020/21 Draft Budget Proposals **(17<sup>th</sup> February 2020)**

Over the year the Scrutiny Committee held **11** committee meetings and wrote **14** letters to the Cabinet sharing their comments/ recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. The majority of meetings were webcast during this year and attracted 375 viewers.

Members have attended a number of other scrutiny events, including work programming meetings, and pre-meetings prior to Committee and task & finish group meetings.

## BRIEFING INFORMATION

### Highway Resurfacing Programme – Member Briefing Note (1st October 2019)

---

The meeting on 1<sup>st</sup> October 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on the Highway Resurfacing Programme for 2019/20. Members were able to reflect upon the content of the draft 'Highways Resurfacing Programme', considering the sections on:

- Draft Resurfacing Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Reconstruction Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Micro Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Grouted Macadam Sites – 2019/20

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

## **Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update (1st October 2019)**

---

The meeting on 1<sup>st</sup> October 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to assess the progress that has been made towards establishing Cardiff's District Heat Network; in particular to consider how close the Council was to agreeing a final business case and the necessary procurement arrangements required to deliver the scheme. Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member that included the following points:

- Members viewed it as a very positive scheme for the Council that would make a significant contribution in reducing Cardiff's carbon footprint, and thanked the officers for their hard work.
- Members asked for clarification on the potential financial risks facing the Council from the District Heat Network; asked for confirmation of the point at which the scheme would become financially unviable for the Council; and requested details of the financial monitoring process.

## **Informal Waste Management Briefing (5th November 2019)**

---

The meeting on 5<sup>th</sup> November 2019 gave Members the opportunity to receive a private briefing from the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and supporting officers on recent developments in the Recycling & Waste Management Service. The meeting was held jointly with the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee, and was structured to consider:

- The performance of Cardiff's Waste Management Service.
- The challenges & opportunities facing Cardiff's Waste Management Service.
- Future proposals relevant to Cardiff's Waste Management Service.

The contents and findings arising from the meeting will be used to identify topics for future scrutiny and potential task & finish work.

## **National Development Framework – Member Briefing Note – (20th November 2019)**

---

The meeting on the 20<sup>th</sup> November 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to discuss and comment on the Cabinet response to the Welsh Government's National Development Framework 2020-2040.

The National Development Framework (NDF) is a new development plan which will set the direction for development in Wales from 2020 to 2040. At the time it was being prepared by the Welsh Government and represented the highest tier of statutory development plans in Wales. It was designed to provide a framework to be built upon by the Strategic Development Plans (SDPs) at a regional level, and Local Development Plans (LDPs) at a local authority level.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.



## Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan – Member Briefing Note (20th November 2019)

---

The meeting on 20<sup>th</sup> November 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on the Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan. Members were able to reflect upon the content of the Cabinet report titled 'Rights of Way Improvement Plan (ROWIP) 2020-30' that was due to be presented at the Cabinet meeting on the 21st November 2019.

The key sections of the new plan included:

- **Section 1** - providing an introduction and background to the ROWIP and the Cardiff Public Rights of Way (PROW) network;
- **Section 2** – providing the reasons for making a new ROWIP for 2020-30.
- **Section 3** – providing details of the New Assessment, which looks at 3 main points: Reviewing ROWIP 1: 2008-18; Evaluating the current network; and, Evaluating the public's future needs and opportunities of the network.
- **Section 4** - outlining the Statement of Action for ROWIP 2020-30, which has 5 Key Strategies for the long term aims over the 10-year period as listed below. **Section 5** - The Key Aims provided a detailed plan of the Council's priorities over the next 10 years.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

## **Member Briefing Note: Fireworks (3rd March 2020)**

---

The meeting on 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing Note: Fireworks'. Members were able to discuss a range of firework related challenges, including:

- Firework safety issues;
- Firework Code;
- Fireworks Law in the United Kingdom;
- Fireworks Available to the Public;
- Restrictions on sale & use;
- A range of RSPCA Proposals;
- House of Commons Petitions Committee Fireworks Report.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report. At the end of the meeting the Committee agreed to monitor the problem, and consider adding it to their work programme in future.

## **Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019 (3rd March 2020)**

---

The meeting on 3rd March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019'. During this item Members were able to discuss the reasons for the Cabinet the report, and the following proposed amendments:

- **Amendment 1:** *Council agrees as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will introduce Green Belt(s) in areas of Cardiff.*
- **Amendment 2:** *Council agrees that as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will ensure that there is proper public transport easily accessible for residents of all new developments and in place at an early stage.*
- **Amendment 3:** *Council agrees that as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will ensure that the design of new developments will be relevant to the local area and of the highest quality achievable.*

In addition to this, Members received a briefing on the next steps for Cardiff's Local Development Plan and were asked to note the contents of the paper.

## INQUIRIES

### **Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' – (21st January 2020)**

The meeting on 21<sup>st</sup> January gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Strategic Planning & Transport; and Social Care, Health & Well-being attended the meeting and were supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided, and following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Positive Report Response** - The Committee was pleased by number of recommendations that had been accepted, and the overall positive response to the report. In particular, they welcomed the comments that were made by Councillor Wild during his opening statement that thanked the Committee for the piece of work and the valuable contribution that it made.
- **Recommendation 6 – Low Emission Neighbourhoods** – During the meeting Members questioned why Recommendation 6 had been rejected, when the draft 'Transport White Paper' had talked about similar initiatives being delivered across the city, for example, 'streets for health'. Councillor Wild explained that if the timing had been slightly different, and with some reflection, 'Recommendation 6' could have been accepted as it is something that aligns with the aims of the Transport White Paper. Members asked the Cabinet Members to revisit the recommendation and provide the Committee with feedback on the conclusion.
- **Bold Taxi Statement** - The first part of 'Recommendation 19' stated that:

- *The Council makes a clear statement that sets out the Council's ambitions for taxi emission standards in the city and explains out how this might be achieved, for example, Nottingham has stated that it wants to significantly reduce taxi emissions in the city by converting all of its taxi fleet to electric by 2025.*

Members felt that this had not been properly addressed in the Cabinet response, and asked if there were any proposals to publish a target date for improving taxi standards. The Committee emphasised that the Council needed to provide a positive statement to help drive taxi improvements, and asked the Cabinet Members to reconsider the response.

- **Local Motor Industry** - The Committee was disappointed at the response to 'Recommendations 23 & 24' which focused on developing closer working ties with the local motor industry. They felt that developing these relationships could only help increase the popularity of low emission vehicles, which would be a positive thing for Cardiff. The Committee asked the Cabinet Members to reconsider the response, and as a minimum ensure that all local car dealerships were aware of all of the electric charging points in Cardiff, including those provided by the Council.
- **Electric Charging Points** - At the meeting the Chair asked about the new electric charging points that had been rolled out across Cardiff, along with the rationale as to how and why the sites had been selected. The Committee asked for details of all of the new Council electric charging points and the information that was used to select the sites.

## **Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff**

---

During much of 2019/20 the Committee worked on an inquiry titled 'Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff'. Scoping meetings took place in April 2019, and a terms of reference for the inquiry was agreed. This is set out below:

*The aim of the inquiry is to provide Members with the opportunity to explore and consider how the Council can support and help improve the biodiversity in Cardiff. In particular this will include scrutiny of:*

- *The development of Cardiff's Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, its structure, aims and objectives;*
- *The ongoing implications of Cardiff's Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, future reporting and monitoring of the document;*
- *The approach taken by other Welsh local authorities to develop biodiversity forward plans and to identify best practice in this area;*
- *The Council's current role, obligations and statutory / legislative requirements for supporting and improving biodiversity;*
- *The importance of Cardiff's biodiversity and ecosystems;*
- *The resources available to support and improve biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *Community collaboration and other partnership working approaches to understand how they help support and enhance biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *The importance of raising awareness of biodiversity issues in Cardiff – internally, with key stakeholders and the public;*
- *Cardiff's Green Infrastructure Strategy – including the benefits of green infrastructure and ecosystem services;*
- *Green Infrastructure Management – including the Green Infrastructure Group;*

- *Cardiff Green Infrastructure SPG and Planned Development;*
- *The Green Infrastructure Spatial Strategy;*
- *Green Infrastructure Implementation Programme (Pollinators Action Plan, Individual Park Management Plans, Local Nature Plan, River Corridors, Tree Strategy, Cross border initiatives, other plans & projects);*
- *Sustainable drainage – links with the SuDS Approval Body process.*

The task & finish report was completed in November 2019, and in doing this the Committee undertook and delivered the following:

- 7 task group meetings;
- 15 separate witness sessions;
- Dealing with 22 witnesses (14 external to the Council);
- Worked closely with the Cabinet Members and Council staff who are responsible for managing biodiversity and the natural environment in Cardiff;
- Received witness contributions from a range of expert witnesses.

The draft task & finish report was approved at the Committee meeting on the 20<sup>th</sup> November, and then presented to Cabinet at their meeting on the 23<sup>rd</sup> January 2020. In concluding the task & finish exercise made a series of recommendations including the following:

- Asking the Council to declare a biodiversity emergency to sit alongside the climate change emergency;
- To employ an additional Ecologist or Section 6 Officer to help ensure that the Council meets the requirements of the Section 6 Duty;
- Where practically possible, to limit the use of pesticides such as glyphosate across the Council estate;
- The Council should build a biodiversity well-being commitment into Capital Ambition, decision-making processes, business plans and policies;
- The Council should link biodiversity and the resilience well-being objective into Cardiff's Local Development Plan when it is revised in 2020;

- The Council should deliver a series of actions to improve connectivity of habitat across Cardiff. This would help enhance biodiversity in the city;
- The Council should create and publish a community growing policy;
- The Council should work with Elected Members, partner organisations, volunteer groups and the public to develop a 'Plant a Tree Scheme'.

The Committee is due to receive a full Cabinet response to the task & finish report during 2020/21.

DRAFT



## **Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’ – (March 3<sup>rd</sup> 2020)**

---

The meeting on 3<sup>rd</sup> March gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’ . The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the People & Communities Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided, and following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Enforcement Teams** – Members asked for further details of the proposed ‘Whole Council’ approach to litter enforcement which they were told would involve better use of a wide range of Council resources across the city. The Committee agreed to add it to the work programme for 2020/21.
- **Camera Powers** – Members were supportive of the use of cameras to target littering offences, particularly for litter thrown from vehicles on key routes into and out of the city. They agreed to support any Welsh Government lobbying that the Council decided to undertake to enhance the use of cameras to target littering offences.
- **Litter Action Plan** – During the meeting an officer explained that the full response to the report recommendations would be put into an action plan. The Committee look forward to receiving a copy of this document, and hope that it will deal with concerns that they had regarding the ‘partially accepted’ and ‘accepted in principle’ responses.
- **Cardiff App** – The Committee asked that all new Cardiff residents are automatically sent information on the app when registering for Council tax; this they felt would help increase the uptake of the app and in turn help improve the collection of litter and fly tipping data.

- **QR Codes for Bins** – During the meeting a Member suggested that placing QR codes on bins would be a cheap and effective way of monitoring the use of bins in the city. The Assistant Director for Street Scene thought that this was a good idea and confirmed that he would look into how it might work in Cardiff. Members asked for a progress update on the suggestion once it had been reviewed.
- **Recycling & Pop Up Bins** – Members were disappointed that the Council was not looking to roll out recycling and pop up bins to wards outside the city centre. They felt that using these type of bins would encourage better recycling habits, and asked the Cabinet Member to reconsider how these are allocated across Cardiff.
- **Four Day Working** – Members noted that the idea of four day working was being considered. The Committee asked that they were kept informed on any developments, and agreed to carry out scrutiny on any new proposals that are brought forward.

## PERFORMANCE MONITORING

### Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (17th September 2019)

The meeting on the 17<sup>th</sup> September 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport and officers from Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on the content of a Cabinet report titled 'Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report' that was due to be presented to Cabinet on Thursday 26<sup>th</sup> September 2019. In addition to this, Members were able to ask any questions that they had on the delivery of the Cardiff's Local Development Plan.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- Members were concerned that measures contained within the Annual Monitoring Report suggested that in the last three years the level of physical activity had declined. They asked what the point of the Local Development Plan was if people weren't getting healthier, and asked for an explanation on how the Local Development Plan could be used to reverse this trend.
- Members were concerned that only 40% of the housing completions set out against the Local Development Plan had been achieved, and that only 25% of the affordable housing allocation has been completed creating a 15% lag between the two targets. This was a particular concern because 75% of the affordable housing target needed to be delivered in less than seven years. The Committee asked for assurance that progress would be

made in the next few years to significantly increase the number of affordable properties in Cardiff.

- The Annual Monitoring Report showed a gradual decline in the number of sustainable travel journeys for education, stating that trips for '*education has seen a significant decrease*'. Members felt that this was a concern since school traffic was significantly adding to congestion in Cardiff at the beginning and end of every school day, and so what the Council proposed to do to reverse the trend and increase the number of sustainable journeys to and from school.
- During the meeting there was some debate around planning decisions for student accommodation in the city. Some Members questioned the temporary change of use planning status that had been applied for and granted on some student developments in Cardiff – this meant that, on a temporary basis, the accommodation could now be occupied by other residents, i.e. not students. They were concerned that a precedent had been set, meaning that other developers could follow suit should their developments fail to attract sufficient numbers of students. Members felt that this presented risks in terms of building standards and receipt of planning obligation monies. The Committee went on to question the level of demand for student accommodation in Cardiff, particularly as the Annual Monitoring Report states '*current evidence shows the further strength of the student accommodation market in Cardiff*'. A Member cited a recent Savills report which provided an opposite view. The Committee asked for a copy of the evidence used to support the claim that '*current evidence shows the further strength of the student accommodation market in Cardiff*'.
- The Committee welcomed the positive cycling results that were included in the Annual Monitoring Report, however, they were concerned that congestion levels continue to increase across the city (for example, from 27% in 2017 to 28% by 2018). They felt that reducing congestion levels in Cardiff should be one of the fundamental principles of the Local Development Plan, and agreed to monitor the progress made in this area.

## **Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20 (1st October 2019)**

---

The meeting on the 1<sup>st</sup> October 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment, the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment and Peoples & Communities Directorates.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

The Committee was concerned that Cardiff would not achieve the Welsh Government recycling target of 64% during 2019/20. The 2018/19 outturn result for the recycling indicator was 59.3%, which meant that the city had to achieve a 4.7% increase in one year. Members felt that achieving such a large increase would require a significant change to Cardiff's waste collection approach, and that currently no such proposals exist. Swansea City Council, a comparable Welsh local authority, achieved 63% recycling during 2018/19 – this meant that it only had to achieve a 1% improvement in 2019/20. Members felt that the Council should look at how Swansea had achieved 63% recycling, and then analyse the reasons for the 3.7% difference. Understanding the differences between the results of the two comparable local authorities should provide Cardiff with some of the answers that it needs.

- The Committee was concerned by the very high sickness rates in the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. At the end of Quarter 3 the Directorate was anticipating 17.6 FTE sick days per employee for 2018/19. Officers explained that they were committed to reducing the current sickness levels, but that they had to work within the existing Council sickness policy. Members accepted this, however, felt that something had to change as sickness was having an impact on budgets

and service delivery. The Committee asked for clarification on the following:

- **Return to Work Interviews** – the Directorate was completing return to work interviews in 98% of reported sickness cases. This was a very high figure and suggested that managers were working hard to follow the Council’s sickness policy. Unfortunately sickness rates had continued to rise, suggesting that the policy was not be working effectively in parts of the Council. Members asked for confirmation if there were any plans in place to review the effectiveness of the policy.
- **Overspend Costs** – the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was overspent by £1.265 million in 2018/19. The biggest contributor to this deficit was the Recycling & Waste Management Service with an overspend of £2.947 million. Members asked for confirmation on how much of the overspend could be directly attributed to high sickness rates, for example, the ‘back filling’ of posts due to sickness.
- **Increasing Sickness Rates** – Members noted that sickness rates had continually increased for a number of years; this was having an impact on budgets and service delivery. Reversing this change required strategic planning and leadership from the Council’s Senior Management Team. The Committee asked for a summary of the proposals that the Head of Paid Service and the Senior Management Team had put forward to stem this increase and ultimately reduce sickness levels in the Directorate and across the wider Council.
- A Member asked about plans for a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in the north of Cardiff, and was told that at present the Council had been unable to identify a suitable site. The Committee asked for a list of potential sites that have been identified, and the reasons why these had been deemed unsuitable, along with assurance that the search for a new site would continue.

- Members feel that they need some clarity on the conflicting sustainable travel data that had been provided to the Committee. For example, sustainable travels seems to be increasing, but at the same time journeys by bus and train are declining. In addition to this congestion had been increasing while modal shift targets appeared to have changed. To help address this the Committee asked for a list of all the transport performance indicators being used by the Council, to include details of how these are defined, how they are measured, and the results for the last three years.
  
- Some Members expressed concern at the reducing number of sustainable journeys to and from school in Cardiff. This was a worry because school traffic made a significant contribution to congestion twice a day; reduced active travel, and failed to create a sustainable travel mind-set in young people. The Committee suggested that the Council should look at transport to schools again, and review its approach to bus provision.
  
- At the meeting it was noted that the Highways Service had an underspend of £1.124 million in 2018/19, and that this saving had helped to reduce the wider Directorate overspend to £1.265 million. The Committee was advised during Budget Scrutiny that the total projected Highway budget for 2018/19 (capital and revenue) was £5.804 million, and so were concerned that that a £1.124 million underspend (approximately 19% of the total budget) had been achieved in an area that is consistently considered a citizen priority. They felt that such a saving was short sighted, as the Highway Asset requires sustained investment to ensure that the speed of deterioration does not increase. They asked the Cabinet Member to:
  - Confirm from which part(s) of the Highways budget the savings were achieved;
  - Explain how the decision was taken to allow an underspend against this budget;
  - Provide details of any consultation that was undertaken around taking this saving;
  - Provide the Committee with assurance that this underspend has not contributed to any unnecessary deterioration of the Highway Asset.

## Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (20th November 2019)

---

The meeting on the 20<sup>th</sup> November 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update'. The item was supported by Councillor Michael Michael - Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Councillor Lynda Thorne - Cabinet Member for Housing & Communities and Councillor Norma Mackie, Chair of Cardiff's Licensing & Public Protection Committee. They will be supported by officers from Shared Regulatory Services and the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. In addition to this, representatives from the Wales Audit Office were in attendance to discuss the content of the report titled 'Delivering with Less – Environmental Health Services'. The purposed of the report was to:

- **Four Year Progress Update:** Consider the performance of Shared Regulatory Services since it was established in May 2015;
- **Annual Report 2018/19:** Consider the Shared Regulatory Services Annual Report 2018/19; and,
- **Wales Audit Office Report:** To consider the findings and actions falling out of the recent Wales Audit Office report titled 'Delivering with Less – Environmental Health Services'.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- **Taxi Marshals** – Members sought clarification on the number of taxi marshals operating in the city centre, the hours that they worked and details of who held responsibility for managing the staff.
- **HMO Licensing Scheme** – Members acknowledge the success of the HMO licensing scheme in Cathays and Plasnewydd and encouraged the Council to expand the geographical range of the policy to other parts of the city.



- **High Rise Buildings & Fire Safety** – At the meeting an officer commented on the proportionately high number of high-rise buildings in Cardiff that had recently failed fire safety tests. This had created a significant safety issue and placed many residents in a very challenging financial position. Members were concerned by this and referred the item to the Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee.
- **Shared Regulatory Services – Statutory Obligations** – Members asked for confirmation that the Shared Regulatory Services was delivering against all of the Council’s statutory obligations, and to provide supporting evidence to verify that this was the case.
- **Enforcement Action Income** – At the meeting it was acknowledged that taking enforcement action through Shared Regulatory Services was a costly exercise, and that even when successful, neither the Council or Shared Regulatory Services was entitled to keep the cost of the fine. Members felt that the value of the fines should be passed back to the Council or Shared Regulatory Services and reinvested back into frontline service delivery, and recommended that the Council lobby the Welsh Government to ask that the fine money is passed back to local authorities in future.

## Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19 – (3rd March 2020)

---

The meeting on the 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment and People & Communities Directorates. The purpose of the report was to review the performance reports relevant to the terms of reference of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee for Quarter 1 (April to June 2019) and Quarter 2 (July to September 2019).

Following discussion, questions and comments, the Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- **Recycling Target Fines** – It was apparent that the Council would not achieve the Welsh Government Recycling target of 64% during 2019/20. Member asked for confirmation on, i) the value of the potential fine that the Welsh Government could be levied against the Council for failing to reach the target; ii) details of the work and dialogue that the Council was undertaking with Welsh Government to avoid the fines being applied; iii) examples of local authorities who missed the recycling target in 2018/19.
- **LEAMS DATA** – A Member asked for an explanation as to why Quarter 1 (96.54%) produced a better score for the indicator described as '*the percentage of highways and relevant land inspected of a high or acceptable standard of cleanliness*' than Quarter 3 (94.32%), as in his experience Quarter 1 was always worse for litter than Quarter 3.
- **Enforcement Teams** – A Member asked for details of what the proposed 'Whole Council' approach to litter enforcement entailed. He was told that it would involve better use of a wide range of Council resources across the

city, and that they were hoping for Cabinet support to fund the proposals in the summer. The Committee asked for more information on the scheduled changes and agreed to add proposals to the future work programme.

- **Camera Powers** – Members were supportive of the use of cameras to target littering offences, and acknowledged that existing legislation wasn't strong enough. They recommended that the Council should lobby the Welsh Government to improve existing powers to enhance the use of cameras to target littering offences.
- **QR Codes for Bins** – During the meeting a Member suggested that placing QR codes on bins would be a cheap and effective way of monitoring the use of bins in the city. The Assistant Director for Street Scene thought that this was a good idea and confirmed that he would look into how it might work in Cardiff. The Committee asked for a progress update on the matter after it had been reviewed.
- **Four Day Working** – Members noted that the idea of four day working was being considered, and asked for regular updates and an opportunity to scrutinise any future proposals.
- **Funding for Active Travel Schemes** – Members asked for details on existing sums and current funding bids that are in place to support active travel for schools.

## PRE DECISION SCRUTINY

### **Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements (12th June 2019)**

---

The meeting on the 12<sup>th</sup> June 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; the Cabinet Member for Social Care, Health & Well-being; Dr Porter from Public Health Wales; and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the meeting was to undertake pre decision scrutiny on a report titled 'Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan – Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements', prior to it being received at the Cabinet meeting on the 13<sup>th</sup> June 2019.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Preferred Option Modelling** – At the start of the meeting there was some confusion around exactly what had been included in the modelling for the preferred option. For example, it was explained that the bus station would not be complete by the start of 2021 and, therefore, it had not been modelled into the overall scheme. This created some confusion since the new bus station was one of the main features on the map setting out the new City Centre Schemes. Members asked for clarification on which developments (for example the new bus station and BBC offices at Central Square) had been built into the modelling, and which assumptions had been used in terms of numbers of people and journey movements.
- **Castle Street & Westgate Street** – Members raised some concerns about how the air quality improvements would be achieved in Castle Street and Westgate Street, given that the existing traffic would still have to pass

through a narrower area. They suggested that a large volume of traffic would still try to access what is already a restricted area, which in turn would slow vehicles down and increase pollution. They were also concerned that some traffic would just be displaced to other parts of the city, resulting in the air quality problem just being moved. To respond to this Members asked for clarification on the following:

- If the preferred option (CASAP) reduces traffic into the city centre by 30%, given that the model only assumes a 3.5% modal shift where does the balance of the traffic go.
  - If a clear air zone (CAZ) had been introduced, by how much would traffic entering the city centre have been reduced? Also, please confirm where the traffic displaced by the CAZ would go.
- **Taxi Mitigation Schemes** – At the meeting Members were told that a proposed £1.86m had been allocated in the preferred option to support taxi mitigation schemes. An officer explained that the proposal would be available to taxi drivers who were registered in Cardiff and each application would be limited to a maximum contribution of £3,000 per driver. Members were also told that the £3,000 would be allocated to cover running costs and not a front loaded capital contribution to support the initial purchase of a low emission vehicle. The Committee was concerned by this as they believe that the main barrier to purchasing a low emission vehicle for most drivers is the initial cost of purchase and not the annual running cost. Members asked that the Cabinet review this approach and consider the option of providing the grant as a front loaded cost to assist with the actual purchase.
  - **Queen Street Cycling Options** – Members were very supportive of the introduction of more and better quality cycling lanes, however, they were not convinced by the ‘City Centre Loop’ that takes cyclists around the city centre via Boulevard De Nantes and Dumfries Place. The Committee felt that many cyclists who are looking to cross the city centre would ignore the

new loop and simply cycle across Queen Street instead. With this in mind Members asked:

- That the Council review reviews the option of allowing cycling on Queen Street;
  - For details of the consultation that had been carried out with cycling groups in developing this section of cycling infrastructure;
  - For details of the modelling used to assess the number of cyclists using this scheme;
  - If the Council had been able to draw any information or data from the introduction of the Nextbike scheme to help with the development of the proposals.
- **Clean Air Zone (CAZ) v Non Charging Zone (CASAP)** - During the way forward a Member asked if the comparison between the CASAP and CAZ was a fair one. He expanded this by asking why the CAZ had been modelled at all, given that the CASAP achieves compliance and that the government guidance states that '*a CAZ should only be implemented if non-charging alternatives don't achieve compliance*'. As a follow on to this the Committee asked the Cabinet Member to explain, i) if the comparison between the CAZ and CASAP was a fair one, and if so why this was the case; ii) why the CAZ was modelled at all, given that the CASAP achieved compliance.
  - **Taxis Registered in other local authority areas** – At the meeting Members commented on the large number of taxis that are registered by neighbouring local authority areas and are freely operating in Cardiff. Members understood that this was largely out of the control of the Council, and that a Welsh Government review of taxi services was ongoing – the hope was that this piece of work would standardise taxi licensing across Wales. In the letter the Committee asked the Cabinet Member to encourage the Welsh Government to complete its review of taxi services so that it does not undermine the challenge of achieving air quality compliance in Cardiff.

- **EV Infrastructure** - During the meeting a Member asked for details of the proposals for the provision of public EV charging infrastructure in the city. Members felt that charging infrastructure would encourage drivers to switch to lower emission vehicles; without such provision it would be difficult for the change to happen.
- **Mandatory Retrofitting of Buses** – The Committee was told that the preferred option assumed an 80% uptake of remaining non-Euro 6 buses to Euro 6. Some Members were of the view that mandatory retrofitting of buses should be set at 100%, assuming that the Council was agreeing to cover the cost (based on the £2.25million contribution). They believed that this would send out a clear message, and would be consistent with the proposed changes to taxi licensing standards.

## Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy (2nd July 2019)

---

The meeting on the 2<sup>nd</sup> July 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to consider the development of the Cardiff Food Strategy prior to it being received by Cabinet on the 26th September 2019.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- **Hydroponic Hub** – Members found the idea of a 'Hydroponic Hub' very interesting, particularly as such a venture could provide an opportunity for local residents to grow a range of produce out of season. Members acknowledged there was an established allotment community in Cardiff, and that many of these would welcome an out of season opportunity to grow food. On this basis the Committee recommended that if the Council did propose developing a 'Hydroponic Hub' then it should engage with the allotment community to establish interest and commitment to take the project forward.
- **Local Food Market** – Members feel that Cardiff has a strong local food community, but lacks a permanent base where the local food offer can be showcased. A Member pointed out that the city does not have an equivalent of Borough Market, and that such a facility would add sustainability, economic and tourism benefits. The Committee asked the Cabinet Member to look into the feasibility of developing such a venue in the city centre.
- **Local Food Quality Mark** - The Committee supported the idea of creating a local food quality mark for Cardiff. They felt that this could be introduced



to identify locally produced food that meets an agreed standard. It would help local food growers, support the local economy and incentivise sustainability.

- **Beef** - During the meeting a Member suggested that the Council should probably play a greater role in determining what was consumed at Council establishments and in school canteens. For example, beef, beef and beef had dominated the menu at his daughter's school for the last three days. He went on to highlight the current environmental crisis facing the planet, making reference to the negative impact that the beef industry has on large parts of the world. He continued by suggesting that the Council should use its influence in the procurement process to understand where our beef came from, for example, providing assurance that it was locally produced and not a product of Brazil where huge deforestation is taking place to enable production. He concluded by suggesting that the Council needed to be sure of the carbon footprint of the food that it procures and consumes. The Committee agreed with this suggestion and encouraged the Council to, i) do all it can to produce a greener menu that supports the Council's wider carbon reduction commitment; ii) encourage schools to do more to promote healthy eating on the curriculum, while at the same time promoting food sustainability.

## **Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision – (17th September 2019)**

---

The meeting on the 17<sup>th</sup> September 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide the Committee with an overview of the national issue around the rising costs of funerals, and to consider Cardiff's Draft Affordable Funerals Strategy that seeks to inform the public of funeral costs and the options they have to procure an affordable and dignified funeral.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members congratulated the Cabinet Member and the staff in Bereavement & Registration Services for winning 'Best Service Team of the Year – Cemetery & Crematorium Category' at the APSE awards.
- During the meeting Members were told that Bereavement & Registration Services was looking into the development of some type of funeral plan or bond to help local residents to save for funeral expenses. The Committee asked for information on the type of plan or scheme that the Council was looking to deliver, along with an explanation of the potential barriers and benefits that various options might provide.
- The Committee was told that people are generally reluctant to talk about future funeral arrangements, and that avoiding such a conversation could make things difficult for those left to pick up the pieces and potentially channel families and individuals into funeral poverty. Members were told that Bereavement & Registration Services was due to start a 'Broader Conversations Campaign' that would provide 'pre-need advice' along with counselling and support for those struggling to manage the financial and

emotional difficulties that can accompany the planning of a funeral. The Committee welcomed the roll out of such a campaign, and asked for assurance that all staff providing the counselling and advice were properly trained.

- Members welcomed the news that the Council had identified an ashes scatter area along the River Taff, and asked for details of the exact location prior to any public announcement.

DRAFT

## Cardiff's Transport White Paper (21st January 2020)

---

The meeting on the 21<sup>st</sup> January gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's Transport White Paper'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport, officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate; Mark Barry - Professor of Practice in Connectivity, Cardiff University and Stuart Cole CBE – Professor of Transport at the University of South Wales. The purpose of the report was to consider the content of the draft 'Transport White Paper: Transport Vision 2030', and to discuss the options for funding the delivery of the proposed transport infrastructure. The report was due to be presented to Cabinet on Thursday 23<sup>rd</sup> January 2020.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- **A Positive Transport Ambition** - Members were supportive of the proposed ten-year transport vision that is set out in the draft 'Transport White Paper'. They felt that if the combination of schemes contained within the document were delivered, then moving around Cardiff would become easier, air quality would improve and both carbon emissions from vehicles and congestion would reduce.
- **Cross City Connectivity** - The Committee was fully behind the proposals to improve connectivity across Cardiff. They believed that projects such as the Cardiff Crossrail Tram – Train Line, the Cardiff Circle Line and new cross-city bus network would address this longstanding problem.
- **Importance of Engaging with Bus Companies** – Improving bus provision in the city is a core aim of the draft 'Transport White Paper'. Indeed, section 2 of the document titled 'Bus Growth' is exclusively dedicated to improving bus travel into and around the city. During the meeting a Member commented on the importance of the bus as a mode of

transport in the draft 'Transport White Paper', and asked for details on how much engagement had happened with the various private bus companies who operate in the city. He was told that regular engagement had taken place with the private bus companies, however, much work still needed to happen to deliver the vision set out in the plan – for example, developing governance and partnership agreements. The Committee see that bus has a central place in Cardiff's transport plans, therefore, ask that you ensure that the Council works and fully engages with all of the private bus companies during every stage of the delivery of the plan.

- **Deliverability & Funding** - The Committee supported the ambition and vision contained within the draft 'Transport White Paper', whilst having a number of concerns on the deliverability and funding of the proposals. To ease concerns they asked:
  - For assurance that the 10 year vision was achievable, along with an explanation as to why this was the case.
  - That planning was underpinned by 'lessons learnt' from other major projects infrastructure and transport projects.
  - That the Council adhered to best practice throughout delivery.
  - That 'slippage' was built into the planning timeline and that the Council maintains a series of 'plan B' options to turn to should the worst happen.
  - That transport infrastructure needed to be in place before any charging takes place, and that any monies raised should be specifically ring-fenced for transport infrastructure.
  - An explanation on how the £1 bus journeys scheme would work, and provide detail of how it might be funded.

## **Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance (21st January 2020)**

---

The meeting on the 21<sup>st</sup> January 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the People & Communities Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the report due to be received by Cabinet on Thursday 23<sup>rd</sup> January and to review:

- The outline proposals for the new education campaign that would focus upon recycling performance;
- The draft strategy titled 'Working together to improve recycling for Cardiff'.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members welcome the introduction of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme, seeing it as a positive step forward that should help Cardiff make improvements on current recycling rates.
- The Committee felt that the Council could apply a similar 'Pink Sticker' approach to the municipal waste stream, i.e. a sticker that is used to identify municipal waste that includes material that can be recycled. They accepted the argument that such a change should not be introduced immediately as the public needed to adapt to the current proposal, however, they felt that this was something that the Council could look at in the future.
- Members were told that the Council was looking to enhance waste collection technology, for example, by potentially introducing RFID stickers to improve the quality and speed of data collection. The Committee welcomed this approach as it would improve the data held by the Council,

putting it in an informed position so that it can better target waste collection resources.

- The Committee felt that to maximise the impact of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme the Council waste webpage page needed to be as engaging and interactive as possible, therefore, they recommended that Recycling & Waste Management review the information on the site to identify how improvements could be made.
- A Member commented on a number of missed nappy collections, and the problems that this had presented for some local residents. An officer explained that the Council was working with Welsh Government to improve the reliability of collection schedules, and to roll out 'yellow nappy bins' across the city. The Committee welcomed this development.

## **Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 & Corporate Overview / Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 (17th February 2020)**

---

The meeting on the 17<sup>th</sup> February 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 & Corporate Overview / Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance and officers from Resources, People & Communities and Planning, Transport & Environment Directorates. The purpose of the report was to provide Members with an opportunity to scrutinise the sections of the Council's Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023, and Draft Cabinet 2020/21 budget consultation proposals relevant to the terms of reference of the Committee.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance that included the following points:

### **Corporate Overview**

- **Capital Borrowing Concerns** - During the meeting Members asked how sustainable the Council's proposed Capital Programme was over the next five years, and questioned the impact that this might have upon the wider revenue budget. The five year capital programme contained £938,875 million in proposals; much of which would need to be repaid by funds from the Council's revenue budget. An officer explained to the Committee that the current proposals had been assessed during the budget setting process, and that they were deemed both deliverable and affordable. Given the wider uncertainty and risk facing the United Kingdom economy, the Committee asked for assurance that the allocated capital budget was affordable.

### **Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21**



- **Staffing for Transport Projects** – A Member expressed concern that the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was reducing staff numbers at a time when the number of schemes coming through was increasing (particularly transport related). He was told that most of the capital funds for the new transport schemes would include provision for the temporary recruitment of staff to help deliver the projects. He and the Committee were satisfied by this answer, however, they asked for assurance that:

  - The Council would be able to recruit the required number of staff, with the appropriate skills, and within the necessary timescale to deliver the new transport schemes;
  - The Council would be able to employ suitably qualified staff on short term contracts to deliver the work, rather than have to rely on expensive consultants.
  
- **Cycle Parking Provision** – At the meeting a Member questioned why some of the cycle parking provision in the city centre was so poorly located, and asked what could be done to identify better sites in future. As an example, he referred to separate cycle parking facilities adjacent to Marks & Spencer and close to Miller & Carter – both in the city centre. The Committee asked if the Cabinet Member could:

  - Confirm the process that is used to identify suitable cycle parking facilities in Cardiff;
  - Provide details of any consultation that might take place prior to deciding on where to locate cycle parking.
  
- **Capital Allocation – Cardiff City Transport Services Limited (Cardiff Bus)** – Capital line 59 allocated £13.6million for Cardiff Bus across the financial years of 2020/21 and 2021/22. The budget line explained that the funding would be '*subject to a further report to and decision of Full Council, due diligence and other matters*', with the ultimate aim of providing '*a package of support for Cardiff City Transport Services*

*Limited*'. The Committee was concerned by the amount of capital allocated to support Cardiff Bus over two years, and asked for regular updates as developments unfolded.

- **Moving Traffic & Attended Parking Enforcement Cameras** – Line 93 of the capital programme allocated £475,000 towards the installation of 'moving traffic cameras' and 'attended parking enforcement cameras' on new routes in the city centre. The Committee welcomed the introduction of the cameras in the city centre, particularly if they are used to target problem and illegal parking, for example, blocking of bus lanes. The Committee asked for confirmation of the routes that the new cameras were going to target, which offences they would prioritise and where they would be introduced.

#### **Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21**

##### **❖ Delivered by the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate**

- **Flooding** – At the meeting reference was made to the recent flooding that had taken place and the impact that this had on local residents and the Council. Comments were also made about the growing threat of climate change, and the potential implications that this could have upon coastal and river flooding. The Committee asked for an explanation on what the Council was doing to mitigate all types of flood risk, the resources being allocated and any long term forward thinking that was taking place.

##### **❖ Delivered by the People & Communities Directorate**

- **New Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff** – Line 39 of the capital programme allocated £3.325 million across the financial years 2020/21, 2021/22 and 2022/23 for the provision of a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff. At the meeting it was explained to Members that creating such a site in the north of the city was still a political commitment, however, the practicality of identifying a suitable site remained a challenge. The Committee was informed that work would

continue to identify a suitable site, and that capital funding had been committed to the scheme. Members asked for a progress update on identifying a suitable scheme, to include details of sites that had been considered along with a realistic timescale for delivering the new facility.

- **Love Where You Live** – Members welcomed the additional £60,000 that had been included in the budget to help with the delivery of the revamped ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. They felt that the scheme was an excellent educational / awareness raising tool that encouraged volunteer participation and, therefore, provided excellent value for money. The wider budget allocated £4.446 million of new monies for dealing with the collection, removal and processing of waste; this was a huge amount of money when compared to the resources put towards the ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. Members commented that improving how the Council managed waste and achieved cleaner streets was not just down to how it processed, collected and removed waste, it also involved raising awareness and better public education. Following on from this comment the Committee asked for:
  - Details of what the £60,000 for ‘Love Where You Live’ would provide, for example, staff, equipment, promotional budget, etc..;
  - An increase in the funding for ‘Love Where You Live’ as the scheme sends out a very positive message and engages with lots of volunteers providing excellent value for money.

## RECOMMENDED FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items for inclusion on the work programme, and suggest any new issues that may be of interest to the Committee. The following items have been identified during 2019/20 as suitable items for discussion during the 2020/21 work programming process:

- Cardiff's Bus Routes & Services;
- Lamby Way Solar Farm – Member Update;
- Highways Resurfacing Programme;
- Fourth Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report;
- Shared Regulatory Service Annual Report 2019/20 & Business Plan 2020/21;
- Recycling & Waste Management Strategy;
- Waste Collection Productivity;
- Recycling & Waste Management Service Restructure;
- Draft Budget Proposals 2021/22;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarterly Performance;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Directorate Delivery Plan 2020/21;
- Planning, Transport & Environment – Improving Digitalisation;
- Cabinet Response to Scrutiny report Managing Biodiversity;
- Transport for Wales – South Wales Metro Update;
- Transport White Paper.

Scrutiny Services, City and County of Cardiff,

Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW

Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: [scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk](mailto:scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk)

© 2020 City and County of Cardiff